



# Sheriff's Office

## Volusia County

Ben F. Johnson, Sheriff

RECEIVED  
OCT 22 2013  
RECEIVED

To: Captain Raymond Almodovar  
Communications Commander

Date: 09/26/13

From: Lieutenant Michelle L. Newman  
Communications Asst. Commander

File: 113M0119.13

Subject: Supervisor's Inquiry

### INTRODUCTION:

On Wednesday, September 4, 2013 at approximately 1746 hours, Telecommunicator (TC) trainee, Matt Cresenzi (DID 8138), answered a 911 call for a "92 UNC" (Unconscious Person) while working in a training capacity under the direct supervision of Certified Training Officer (CTO) Shauna Justice (DID 7421). TC trainee Cresenzi entered the address into the Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system incorrectly using a "common place location" of the "Ormond Rec Center", rather than entering the specific cross streets of Nova Road and Wilmette Avenue, Ormond Beach, which was provided by the caller. This caused a delay in medical first responders reaching the appropriate location of 440 N. Nova Road, Ormond Beach. TC trainee Cresenzi failed to follow proper address verification procedures and his assigned CTO, Shauna Justice, was totally unaware of the mistake until her trainee brought it to her attention approximately 10 minutes into the call.

### INQUIRY:

On 09/05/13 at 0807 hrs Bob Mandarino, Chief of the Ormond Beach Fire Department, emailed Glenn Lopez, V.C.S.O. Communications Coordinator, requesting a review of a call referenced in an email thread from David King, Battalion Commander of the Ormond Beach Fire Department (See Exhibit A). The email thread referenced a call from the prior day where O.B.F.D. was dispatched and responded to the "Division Rec. Center". The email from David King to Chief Bob Mandarino specifically stated:

*"Yesterday afternoon E-93 was dispatched to Division Rec. Center for a cardiac arrest, upon their arrival there was no patient at that location. Capt Flud requested Q-92 be dispatched to Nova Rec. in case it was at that location. It took several minutes before they were dispatched. From the time of the call until the first unit arrived it was 16 minutes. The patient was not resuscitated and was transported to Memorial where he was pronounced."*

Upon listening to the calls and reviewing the CAD histories associated with Chief Mandarino's email (See Exhibit B - CAD history for F132470177 and Exhibit C - CAD history for

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Dwe".

**F132470180)** Captain Almodovar directed Ed Parrish, V.C.S.O. Communications Coordinator, to gather pertinent facts surrounding this incident and to report his findings to Lieutenant Newman. Lt. Newman was directed to memorialize the facts and details in a Supervisor's Inquiry and to determine if V.C.S.O. policies and procedures were adhered to during the handling of the aforementioned 911 call.

Comm. Coordinator Parrish immediately obtained and reviewed a copy of the CAD history for F132470177 (Ormond Recreation Center) and F132470180 (440 N. Nova Road). Additionally, he listened to all phone and radio traffic associated with the 2 CAD calls/reports. Please see:

**Exhibit D – 911 call for F13247017**

**Exhibit E – Radio Traffic for F13247017 & F13247018**

Upon reviewing all of the associated information with these calls Comm. Coordinator Parrish gleaned the following information: at 1746 hrs the reporting party called 911 to request help for a friend who had collapsed and was unresponsive at the racquetball courts at the "Ormond Rec Center". TC trainee Cresenzi utilized the common place function in CAD which displays establishments and the corresponding address. TC trainee Cresenzi selected the name of the location provided by the caller; however, he failed to recognize the address listed in the common place file *176 Division Ave, OB*, was different than the cross streets provided by the caller which were *Nova Road and Wilmette Ave, OB*. Upon entering the call into CAD, TC trainee Cresenzi continued with pre-arrival instructions and provided detailed CPR instructions for the reporting party to perform on the patient.

As the call developed and units started arriving on scene at the *Division Avenue* location, radio traffic on the TAC channel among first responders indicated they were unable to locate the patient. First responders then requested that the TAC Operator, TC Bowers, tone out an apparatus to respond to the other recreational facility on *Nova Road* in Ormond Beach. TC trainee Cresenzi observed CAD comments entered documenting first responders could not locate the patient. It was then that TC trainee Cresenzi noticed his error and documented in CAD a change in location. Ultimately, TC Zambrana, the primary fire dispatcher, created a new call with the correct address of *440 N. Nova Road, Ormond Beach*, and within 5 minutes of entering the correct address first responders arrived on scene.

On September 10, 2013 at approximately 1800hrs Comm. Coordinator Parrish met with and interviewed TC trainee, Matt Cresenzi. TC trainee Cresenzi, advised that on 09/04/13 at 1746 hours he answered a 911 call. He advised that he entered the information given by the caller into CAD and selected the "common place location" of the "Ormond Rec Center"; however, he failed to check the common place location against the cross streets provided by the caller to ensure accuracy. TC trainee Cresenzi continued to explain that he watched his map screen and observed that the units were responding. When he realized that the units in the field couldn't find the racquet ball courts, which is where the caller advised the patient could be located, he advised his CTO, Shauna Justice, that he entered a wrong location. TC trainee Cresenzi was extremely remorseful for not properly adhering to the address verification procedures.

Next, Comm. Coordinator Parrish met with and interviewed CTO Shauna Justice. CTO Justice stated that she was aware of the 911 call answered and entered by her trainee, Matt Cresenzi, at the "Ormond Rec. Center". She advised that the location that TC trainee Cresenzi picked seemed like the correct choice to her as well. CTO Justice advised she wasn't aware of the wrong location until the units in the field advised they couldn't find the patient. CTO Justice admitted, while TC trainee Cresenzi was taking the 911 call, she was utilizing her personal cell phone on the dispatch floor; in violation of Comm. Center Policy and Procedures. Additionally, she admitted to talking to others on the dispatch floor during the course of TC Trainee entering the aforementioned call and while he was actively providing CPR instructions to the reporting party.

On Tuesday, September 16, 2013 Lt. Newman reviewed the surveillance footage on the dispatch floor specifically searching for 09/04/13 at 1746 hours, the time that this call in question was received. Lt. Newman found the specified surveillance footage and was able to confirm that CTO Justice was in fact using her personal cell phone for approximately the first 15 seconds of the call; which would correlate to when her trainee entered the wrong location. Additionally, while listening more closely to the 911 tape of the call, Lt. Newman could hear CTO Justice talking to other employees on the dispatch floor while TC trainee Cresenzi was talking to the reporting party; even while he provided CPR instructions to the caller. (See **Exhibit D – 911 call and Exhibit F – CD of Video Recording**)

TC trainee Cresenzi was hired on 04/18/13 as VCSO Telecommunicator. On the date and time of this incident TC trainee Cresenzi was training in a "Level 1" capacity, meaning he was being trained by a Certified Training Officer (CTO), specifically to answer 911 calls. The CTO was literally "plugged in" or "tethered" to the CAD computer and 911 phone system with TC trainee Cresenzi so that as needed, the CTO could interject and override the trainee if needed, to ensure calls are handled and entered appropriately. Inclusive of his shift on 09/04/13 TC trainee Cresenzi had trained for 413 hours out of 600 allowable hours in a Level 1 capacity. He was assigned to CTO Shauna Justice on 08/06/13. In review of his Field File notations, TC trainee Cresenzi has had 3 positive entries and no negative entries. The positive comments were for "Excellent location verification", "Job well done for thorough interrogation and quick documentation", and "job well done for location verification, EMD, and Pre-Arrival". It should be noted, that TC trainee Cresenzi has answered more admin and 911 phone calls in the months of June, July, and August than any other employee in the Communications Center. Listed below are his phone stats:

June	914	admin calls
July	1137	admin calls
August	1044	911 calls

Shauna Justice was hired on 04/09/2007 as a VCSO Telecommunicator. She earned her CTO designation on 07/03/12. Shauna resigned from the agency on 10/01/2012 citing personal reasons as well as she was relocating to another state. She was re-hired by V.C.S.O. on 12/31/12 as a Telcommunicator and attended the 5<sup>th</sup> Edition Certified Training Officer course in January of 2013. Since her return she has had numerous Field File entries for INFO (informational entry), POS (positive entry), and Neg (negative entry).

Based on review of her field notes, since her re-hire date, she has had one similar incident where she allowed a trainee, Matt Cresenzi (temporarily assigned to CTO Justice for that day), to enter an incorrect location causing a 4 minute delay on a 92U (Medical Unknown). ( See Exhibit G - CAD history for F132150153 & F132150154) She received a NEG field file entry by her supervisor for the mistake.

While conducting this inquiry Lt. Newman discovered that the TAC Operator, TC Charris Bowers, radio procedures were substandard. Her attitude did not display a sense of urgency in getting the needed information out to the first responders or adhering to their request in a timely manner. Furthermore, first responders in the field had to ask TC Bowers four separate times if another unit had been dispatched to the Nova Road address. TAC Operator TC Bowers should have been more proactive on this call and requested that another unit respond upon the first request from the field. TAC Operator TC Charris Bowers was counseled by Supervisors regarding her radio procedures during this incident.

Regarding the incorrect use of the common place location in CAD, it was determined that the term "Ormond Rec" is commonly used among local residents; however, there is no facility within Ormond Beach officially named "Ormond Rec". To address this issue, Communications Coordinator Glenn Lopez has worked closely with Chief Mandarino of Ormond Beach Fire Department on developing an up to date list of all Leisure Services facilities within the city. The updated list will be included in the CAD common place file.

### **CONCLUSION:**

Based on the facts and circumstances, it is evident that both TC trainee Cresenzi and CTO Justice failed to provide the level of dedicated service that the Sheriff's Office expects and demands. Additionally, both employees failed to adhere to strict address verification procedures and failed to follow the V.C.S.O. Call Handling Guide. Furthermore, CTO Justice failed to properly supervise her trainee.

CTO Justice is in violation of the following V.C.S.O. Directives:

**26.2.33 Inattention to Duties, Loafing, Sleeping** - Employees shall be attentive to job duties and shall not neglect work by inattention, loafing, or sleeping while on duty. *(Violation subject up to a 1 day suspension.)*

**26.2.34 Failure to Follow Directive or Order** - Employees shall adhere to all official Directives and/or orders, and shall faithfully execute all the duties and responsibilities of their assigned position. *(Violation subject up to a 5 day suspension.)*

**26.2.40 Negligence, Not Endangering** - Employees shall not ignore or violate official Directives, orders, or supervisory instructions or knowingly fail to properly execute the duties and responsibilities of their assigned positions. *(Violation subject up to a 5 day suspension.)*

**26.2.124 Compliance With Direct Order of a Superior or Competent Authority** - Employees shall comply with the direct orders or instructions given by a supervisor or superior officer and shall not refuse to comply when orders or instructions are lawful and proper. *(Violation subject up to dismissal.)*

Additionally, CTO Justice is in violation of VCSO Communications Policy regarding:

**Cell Phones, Pagers, Emails And Other Distractions -**

Personal cell phones and pagers are not allowed to be visible or used while in the dispatch room **(See Exhibit H – Communications Policy and Procedure Manual pg 16)**

Based on CTO Justice's prior discipline **(See Exhibit I – Justice's prior discipline)** and based on the seriousness of this incident, it is recommended that this incident be reviewed for possible **Adverse Action**.

TC Trainee Cresenzi is in violation of V.C.S.O. Directives:

**26.2.33 Inattention to Duties, Loafing, Sleeping** - Employees shall be attentive to job duties and shall not neglect work by inattention, loafing, or sleeping while on duty. *(Violation subject up to a 1 day suspension.)*

Based on TC trainee Cresenzi working directly under the supervision of a CTO, it is recommended that he be given an EPN Counseling for his inattentiveness to proper address verification procedures.

It should be noted; on 10/15/13 Lt. Newman presented these findings before Sheriff's Staff for a decision reference Adverse Discipline. It was determined by Sheriff's Staff that CTO Shauna Justice would be suspended for 5 days and TC trainee Cresenzi would receive an EPN.